August 28, 2015

126

- number indicates?
- A. No. This is probably referring --
- 3 Equifax's number. Experian has -- this is reporting
- 4 to those bureaus.
- 5 Q. So what specifically --
- A. So it could go back to what you
- 7 initially asked me of what was called the subscriber
- 8 code number.
- 9 Q. So what information on this form was
- 10 updated? Let me back that up.
- This form is telling -- is OCWEN telling
- 12 the credit reporting agencies that you need to update
- 13 the following information, correct?
- A. It just is providing, how I called it
- earlier, an escalation.
- Q. So if there is information on this form,
- 17 OCWEN is telling the credit reporting agency here is
- what you need to report?
- A. Figuring the AUD will coincide in their
- 20 brains more than an ACDV report.
- Q. So what specifically was updated on this
- 22 form?
- 23 A. Okay. As the document says in the notes
- 24 what was updated, so what it's saying is showing paid
- as agreed has been reported. So it's a paid as

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- agreed and current. And then this is for the months
- March, June, July, October, December 2013, per
- 3 request. And then the response went back to the
- 4 Consumer Financial Protection Bureau stating the
- 5 same.
- Q. Is there any reason OCWEN didn't delete
- 7 the extra account from Mr. Daugherty's account as
- 8 opposed to updating the current account?
- 9 A. I don't know what extra account you're
- 10 talking about.
- 11 Q. The account that Mr. Daugherty and the
- 12 CFPB indicated that OCWEN was showing up on his
- 13 credit report.
- A. We don't have control how the credit
- bureaus report in their system. We only reported one
- 16 trade line to each bureau.
- 0. On the form and several of the other
- forms, just above the account history there is a box
- marked balloon payment due date. Do you see where
- that box is on the AUDF?
- 21 A. On which one?
- Q. On the universal data form, just above
- the account history box on the right side there are
- 24 two boxes. One says balloon payment due date. One
- says balloon payment amount. You see where I'm at?

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

August 28, 2015

128 Okay. A. 2 Why are those boxes empty? Q. 3 MR. MANNING: Object to the form. You can answer. 5 THE WITNESS: I believe this is a fixed 6 rate mortgage and not a balloon. 7 BY MR. NOLAN: If it was a balloon, would OCWEN be 9 required to record something in that box? 10 But it's not a balloon, so we can speak 11 about this account. So how it -- how it reports is 12 based on the note. This is the information in 13 regards to the actual mortgage, whether it was a 14 fixed rate, adjustable rate, balloon, there is a 15 maturity date. So if I had a hypothetical where there 16 was a balloon due, would it be inaccurate to leave 17 that box blank? 18 MR. MANNING: Objection to the form. 19 Calls for a legal conclusion. 20 21 You can answer. 22 THE WITNESS: If there is a balloon 23 amount, I don't know how -- how they would -- how it's completed. 24 25

August 28, 2015

129 BY MR. NOLAN: Q. Okay. 3 (Exhibit No. 23 was marked for identification.) 5 BY MR. NOLAN: This is Exhibit No. 23. Do you need a break? I saw you reaching for your drink. A. I'm just taking a sip. If you want to take a break -- we've 10 been going for a little while here. 11 MR. MANNING: I can take a break. 12 MR. NOLAN: Okay. Good. 13 (A recess was taken.) BY MR. NOLAN: 14 15 I think we left off and I just handed 0. out Exhibit 23. So the response date -- this is 16 17 another ACDV response from OCWEN dated August 8th, 18 2014, correct? 19 A response date, yes. A. 20 And the response code was account information accurate as of date, correct? 21 22 A. Yes. 23 Q. Okay. 24 MR. NOLAN: Can we mark this Exhibit 24? 25

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

130 (Exhibit No. 24 was marked for identification.) 3 BY MR. NOLAN: This is another ACDV response dated 4 5 September 19, 2014, correct? 6 A. Yes. And this states that -- down in the 8 account information toward the bottom of the page, it states he has a current account, correct? 10 A. Yes. I have one more from earlier I wanted to 11 12 double-back to. 13 (Exhibit No. 25 was marked for identification.) 14 15 MR. NOLAN: I didn't make copies of this 16 one, Jason. It's Bates 576, dispute letter. 17 MR. MANNING: 576 and 577. 18 MR. NOLAN: Sorry. That's correct. 19 BY MR. NOLAN: 20 Earlier we were discussing, I believe it 21 was Exhibit 4, there was a response letter sent by 22 OCWEN regarding a dispute in March of 2013. I wanted to introduce this. The date at the top of the page 23 24 indicates March of 2013, correct? 25 A. Yes.

August 28, 2015

131

- Q. It appears to have been faxed at
- 2 8:36 p.m. that evening?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. And it indicates that he was informing
- 5 OCWEN that his Equifax report indicated he was \$6,128
- 6 behind and in foreclosure with OCWEN, correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. And he asked that Equifax correct those
- 9 records, correct?
- 10 A. Yeah. Based on the document. It speaks
- 11 for itself.
- 12 Q. And then the second page he attached a
- printout indicating the incorrect reporting; is that
- 14 correct, as well?
- 15 A. Yes. It's Equifax. All of this is
- dealing with Equifax. How come Equifax didn't do a
- 17 research on their end based on the same disputes that
- 18 they keep sending to OCWEN? It could have been --
- 19 how come -- I mean, obviously it's an error they did
- on their end. How come they didn't conduct a
- 21 research on their end?
- Q. We talked with Equifax, as well.
- 23 A. Okay.
- Q. That's all I've got today.
- 25 A. That's all you have?

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- Q. If that wasn't enough, Mr. Manning may
- have some questions for you.
- 3 EXAMINATION
- 4 BY MR. MANNING:
- 5 Q. One of the documents that was produced
- in this was -- it's often referred to as monthly
- 7 reporting data. It is in the production as OLS 602
- 8 through 645.
- 9 MR. NOLAN: I've got that.
- 10 BY MR. MANNING:
- 11 Q. I'm going to hand you a copy.
- 12 MR. MANNING: Let's mark it as the next
- one, just for identification purposes.
- 14 (Exhibit No. 26 was marked for
- identification.)
- 16 BY MR. MANNING:
- 17 Q. So take a minute and look over what's
- been marked as Exhibit 26. And then just tell me
- when you can identify what these documents appear to
- 20 be.
- A. These are screen prints for OCWEN's
- 22 system, Real Servicing, of the screen prints of what
- 23 the credit reporting department at OCWEN uses.
- Q. When you say screen prints of what the
- 25 credit reporting that OCWEN uses, what does this

- information reflect?
- 2 A. This reflects the account history and
- 3 how -- and how it is reported to the bureaus each
- 4 month.
- 5 Q. During your testimony you've identified
- 6 that there is a -- I can't remember your
- 7 terminology -- something like 30 days in arrears,
- 8 like the reporting happens for the previous 30 days.
- 9 Am I saying that right?
- 10 A. Right. So if they're reporting to the
- credit bureau the 30th, say of, in this case,
- November 30th, then it's being reported as -- to
- reflect as of October 30th -- up to October 30th.
- 14 Q. The screens here, do they use the same
- 15 codes that we saw appearing on some of these
- automated forms, either the AUD or the ACDVs?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Were there any instances in which OCWEN
- 19 reporting on the account for Mr. Daugherty, that upon
- your review evidence that OCWEN was reporting this
- 21 trade line twice at any time?
- 22 A. Not at all. Only one trade line was
- 23 reported to each bureau. And they all get reported
- on a monthly data the same day each month.
- 25 Q. Do all the credit reporting agencies

August 28, 2015

134

- 1 receive the same data from this packet of
- 2 information?
- 3 A. Yes. It gets sent on what they call a
- 4 monthly data report.
- Q. Were there any instances in these
- 6 monthly data reports in which OCWEN reported a
- 7 compliance condition code of XB?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Could you identify those?
- 10 Let me ask you this way. Turn to
- page 639. You tell me if I'm reading this document
- 12 correctly. It says OLS 639. There is two screen
- prints. And towards the bottom there is one that
- says compliance condition code. And then it appears
- to have a code next to it. Do you see that?
- 16 A. Yes, I do.
- 17 Q. And what is that code?
- 18 A. XB.
- 19 Q. And what does XB mean?
- A. XB is that if the loan was in default,
- 21 not to report it.
- Q. I'm not going to ask you to go through
- everything. Is that an example of an instance in
- which on the monthly data tape OCWEN was reporting
- this account with a compliance condition code as XB?

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

135

- A. Yes. It identifies what month that --
- which month that it was reported as an XB code.
- Q. It appears the last month in this
- 4 packet, the monthly reporting data has reporting
- 5 period for March 31st, 2015. I'm looking at Bates
- 6 stamp 645. Do you see that?
- 7 A. Okay.
- 8 Q. So top of the page, do you see the
- 9 reporting period?
- 10 A. Yes.
- Q. What's the reporting period?
- 12 A. It is up through March 31st, 2015.
- 13 Q. Now, if you look towards the bottom,
- since this is the most recent of the monthly data, if
- 15 you go to the account history, I just want to see if
- 16 you can help us understand.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. The account history, when it says --
- 19 there is a number of digits or numerals in that
- bottom right-hand corner. There is a 1, a number 1,
- in the box from May 2012. Do you see that?
- A. Correct.
- Q. What does the number 1 reflect?
- A. Thirty days past due.
- Q. And then April has a zero. What does --

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

136

- again, for the record, April 2012 has a zero. What
- 2 does that reflect?
- 3 A. Current.
- Q. March 2012?
- A. He was in default and was 120 days past
- 6 due.
- Q. And so when it says a 4 for March 2012,
- 8 that is four times 30 days to get to the 120 you
- 9 said?
- 10 A. That is correct.
- Q. After that period, it appears that there
- 12 are no other numbers other than zeros?
- 13 A. That is correct.
- Q. So that would reflect, at least
- according to this monthly data reporting, he was
- 16 current for each of those months?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Is there a compliance condition code on
- 19 this report?
- 20 A. Yes, there is.
- 21 O. What is it?
- 22 A. XB.
- Q. How about the prior month, for the
- reporting period February 2015, is there an XB code
- 25 there?

August 28, 2015

137

- A. Yes, there is.
- 2 Q. It looks like there is an XB code for
- the next series of pages, 641 through 645, and that's
- 4 for the reporting period November 2014 through
- 5 March 2015; is that accurate?
- A. Yes.
- Q. At the beginning of the deposition you
- 8 were asked about background or qualifications for the
- 9 credit analysts. What -- from a very broad
- 10 perspective, what training do those new-hire analysts
- 11 receive?
- 12 A. It's a one-month training, two weeks
- 13 class training, and an additional two weeks shadowing
- 14 training.
- Q. Okay. So the first two weeks is in a
- 16 classroom. What is the substance of that classroom
- 17 training?
- A. How to operate the OCWEN system,
- 19 policies and procedures for credit reporting, as well
- 20 as -- as well as for credit reporting. I did say
- 21 that, credit reporting. And for e-Oscar.
- Q. And then after the classroom, you said
- shadowing. What do you mean by shadowing?
- A. Yes. They sit down with a most current
- 25 credit reporting analyst for additional training as

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

138

- far as how they operate.
- Q. After the two-week classroom training,
- 3 two-week shadowing, and that individual goes live in
- 4 the system, is there any further training or
- 5 supervision of that individual?
- A. Yes. There is always ongoing training,
- 7 whether it's online training within the company, for
- 8 continuous training on policy and procedures, as well
- 9 as codes and things like that.
- 10 Q. What about a quality control program?
- 11 Is there any supervision of the actual work these
- 12 people are doing when they undertake a credit dispute
- 13 review?
- A. Yes. There is a supervisor for teams
- 15 that they have. I'm not sure how many number of
- 16 teams are in that department that handle different
- 17 functions, as well as consumer escalation, which
- 18 means -- also means ombudsman escalation.
- 19 Q. When you say ombudsman escalation, I
- think we saw some of that in the notes. What is
- 21 that?
- A. They deal with the actual consuming; for
- 23 instance, from the Credit Financial Protection
- 24 Bureau.
- Q. There was some testimony about an

August 28, 2015

139

- opening date. So I wanted to have you explain,
- what's the deal with this opening date? There was a
- 3 change in the opening date. How does that work or
- 4 how did that occur?
- 5 A. The reason for the change for the
- opening date, because it was reviewed, looks like,
- 7 according to the notes, around the time the loan was
- 8 being reinstated, and additional, I want to say,
- 9 quality assurance was done, and it was noted that the
- 10 account opening date was incorrect from the prior
- servicer based on the documents that we have in our
- business records, which includes the note, the
- 13 mortgage.
- Q. Would that change appear in the monthly
- 15 data reporting?
- 16 A. It would show -- it would show the
- change in the monthly reporting, in that the credit
- 18 reporting department uses; however, the changes
- 19 cannot be made by the credit reporting department.
- 20 It has to be made by the loan setup department.
- MR. NOLAN: I'm sorry. Can you repeat
- 22 that?
- THE WITNESS: It has to be -- the
- accounts are not altered as far as opening dates.
- 25 Anything dealing with the loan information by the

August 28, 2015

140

- 1 credit reporting gets -- an email is sent, as well as
- 2 coded in the notes to the setup department to make
- 3 that change.
- 4 BY MR. MANNING:
- Q. If you can look at Exhibit 26 on
- 6 page 606, Bates stamped at the right-hand is 606,
- you'll see there is a date opened, about halfway down
- 8 the page, August 26, 1999?
- 9 A. Yes.
- Q. And then on the next page, 607, it says
- date opened July 20th, 1999?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. So is that -- does that reflect the time
- 14 period in which this opened date changed in the
- 15 system as it was reported to the CRAs?
- A. It was changed within that time
- between -- yes, between March 31st, 2012 and
- April 30th, which was then reported with the correct
- open date because, due to the reinstatement, the
- 20 borrower reinstated the account to bring it back
- 21 current.
- Q. So in March 2012 that open date changed.
- 23 What was the status of the borrower's account at that
- 24 time?
- A. It brought the -- at April 30th, 2012,

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

141

- because it's still reporting as of March, it would
- still show as delinquent; however, reporting period
- for May 31st, 2012 it would show the loan as current.
- Q. Okay. So for the record, when you say
- 5 reporting period April 30th, 2012 it's being reported
- as delinquent, that's the number 4 for the March 2012
- 7 account history box, right?
- 8 A. That is correct.
- 9 Q. So at that point in time when the
- opening date changed, the account was 120 days late?
- 11 A. That is correct.
- 12 Q. And then the next month Mr. Daugherty
- brought the account current, and OCWEN for its part
- on its monthly data reported him as current?
- 15 A. That is correct.
- Q. Okay. Knowing how OCWEN is reporting it
- and the fact that Equifax was reporting it
- incorrectly, what were you able to determine as the
- 19 cause of Equifax's error?
- MR. NOLAN: Objection. Calls for a
- 21 legal conclusion.
- 22 BY MR. MANNING:
- Q. What, if anything, according to your
- review of the documents, were you able to determine
- was the cause of this inconsistency with Equifax's

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- credit reporting?
- A. There is no inconsistency how OCWEN was
- 3 reporting. The only thing that changed was the open
- 4 date on the account.
- 5 Q. How did the CRAs interpret that open
- 6 date change?
- 7 MR. NOLAN: Objection. Speculation.
- 8 BY MR. MANNING:
- 9 Q. If you can tell based on your review of
- the documents, did the three national credit
- 11 reporting agencies all interpret that opening date
- 12 the same?
- A. All except for Equifax apparently.
- Q. And what did Equifax interpret
- 15 differently?
- 16 A. They added a trade line.
- Q. When you say they added a trade line,
- what do you mean?
- 19 A. Based on my review.
- Q. Right. What do you mean by that?
- A. They are showing two accounts under the
- same loan number, under Equifax, when Experian and
- 23 TransUnion did not.
- Q. Is that reporting by Equifax something
- 25 that OCWEN can control?

August 28, 2015

143

- A. No.
- Q. Did Equifax ever tell -- according to
- any of these documents that have been produced, did
- 4 it ever tell OCWEN that it was reporting this trade
- 5 line twice?
- 6 A. No.
- Q. According to any of the documents that
- 8 you've seen produced by the plaintiff or any other
- 9 defendant, did Mr. Daugherty ever tell OCWEN that
- 10 Equifax was reporting the same account twice on his
- 11 credit report?
- A. No. Mr. Daugherty complained that
- 13 Equifax is reporting or did report or is reporting
- 14 inaccurate or not reporting correctly and showing him
- 15 as late when he is not.
- 16 Q. There were a number of documents that
- you were shown that were produced by Equifax. Do you
- 18 recall that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. I'm going to see if I can just pull
- these together. It looks like it was Exhibit 7, 8,
- 22 11, 12, 13, and 14. I've got them here. I just want
- 23 to make sure I've got the numbers right. So
- 24 Exhibit 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, and 14 all at the top have
- 25 this Equifax Credit Information Services header with

August 28, 2015

144

- a statement Automated Consumer Dispute Verification.
- 2 Do you see that?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. So you were asked a number of
- questions about these. Are these OCWEN's documents?
- 6 A. No.
- Q. Does OCWEN have any control over these
- 8 documents?
- A. No. And I've stated that earlier.
- Q. Does OCWEN have any input as to how
- 11 Equifax creates, generates, or maintains these
- 12 documents?
- 13 A. No.
- Q. For example, you were asked about this
- box here that says verified as reported, where it's
- checked. It appears to be a form on each of these.
- 17 Is that something that OCWEN controls?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Similarly, with these disputes, dispute
- 20 1, dispute 2, just because it appears on this
- 21 document does that necessarily mean it appeared in
- 22 what was transmitted to OCWEN?
- A. No. They have verified based on the
- 24 comment notes. So I retract. They have based in
- their comment notes, as well as part of the ACDV,

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

- that the account has been verified showing that it's
- Mr. Daugherty's account.
- Q. Right. And let me -- let me clarify
- 4 that. So when you say it's been verified -- let's
- 5 look at one of these ACDVs. Exhibit 18 is one of
- 6 them. I just want to make sure our terminology is
- 7 consistent.
- 8 So you say -- do you have 18 in front of
- 9 you?
- 10 A. 18? That's the notes.
- 11 Q. So here, if you look at the top of this
- ACDV, it's got a Bates stamp 1349 and 1350. It says
- dispute information. Dispute code 001, not his/hers.
- 14 Provide or confirm complete ID. Do you see that?
- A. Yes.
- Q. So when this ACDV is received, this
- 17 request from, in this case -- I guess it doesn't
- 18 say -- from the CRA, that is what OCWEN is being
- 19 asked to do, correct?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. So when it says provide or
- 22 confirm complete ID, that's the inquiry that OCWEN is
- 23 tasked with undertaking, correct?
- A. Yes.
- Q. So from a very high level, when OCWEN

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

146

- 1 receives that inquiry how does it handle that
- 2 dispute?
- 3 A. Based on the dispute code, not his or
- hers, provide or confirm complete ID, so provided a
- 5 complete ID confirming that this account belongs to
- 6 the borrower.
- Q. And then when you refer to the comment
- 8 log, which is marked as Exhibit 5, and you said it
- 9 was verified, that's what you're referring to, that
- 10 it was verified as to that dispute, correct?
- 11 A. That is correct.
- Q. Could you pull out Exhibit 22, please?
- 13 This is that second AUD that was sent. And it's
- dated at the bottom July 2nd, 2014. Do you have that
- in front of you?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. So on this form it says -- OCWEN
- is sending in an AUD. What is the effect of that
- when it's sent into the e-Oscar system? What happens
- 20 to it?
- A. What happens to?
- Q. To the information on the form.
- A. The AUD -- the universal data form?
- 24 Q. Yes.
- A. It gets sent -- it gets sent to all

August 28, 2015

147 bureaus. 2 So this -- the same information on this goes through e-Oscar to all of the bureaus, right? A. Yes. 5 So that would mean Equifax would be 6 receiving it, as well? 7 That is correct. A. All right. So on this AUD it has 9 account information. Do you see the section about 10 account information? 11 A. Yes. 12 And it lists amount past due. Do you 13 see that? 14 A. Yes. 15 What's the amount that's listed as being 0. 16 past due? 17 A. Zero. 18 Q. What's the account status below that 19 listed as? Eleven. A. 21 Do you know what that code stands for? 22 I don't quite know. I believe it's 23 current, but -- oh. Current based on the ACDV. Yes. 24 Okay. So at this point in this AUD 25 OCWEN is telling the CRAs again that this is a

Henderson Legal Services, Inc.

202-220-4158

August 28, 2015

148

- current zero dollar past due account, right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. And that information also appears in the
- 4 account history below, right?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And how did you do this account history
- 7 where it has these numerals again -- we looked at
- 8 this earlier on the last exhibit, the monthly data
- 9 tape, Exhibit 26. Is that the same account history
- information that's being reproduced here as from the
- 11 monthly data tape?
- A. Yes.
- 13 Q. In this account history on this AUD,
- does it identify the borrower as being late any time
- in the last, looks like, 24 months?
- 16 A. No.
- Q. So if a CRA continued to report this
- 18 account as being past due or late, it would be
- inconsistent with what OCWEN is saying in this AUD,
- 20 right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And does OCWEN have any control over
- what that CRA reports?
- 24 A. No.
- Q. Could you turn back to Exhibit 5,

August 28, 2015

149

- 1 please? This is the comment log. You had mentioned
- 2 this -- I can't remember if I'm pronouncing it
- 3 right -- Consumer Ombudsman office?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Turn to OLS 1722, please. There is a
- 6 notation here from the office of the Consumer
- Ombudsman for OCWEN.
- 8 A. Okay.
- 9 Q. So on the entry for April 8th, 2014
- there is what appears to be a reproduction of a note
- 11 from that office; is that right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. And it appears to be a response, but who
- 14 is -- based on your review of these documents, who is
- this response directed to?
- A. To the Consumer Financial Protection
- 17 Bureau.
- Q. Okay. And so from that entry, right
- 19 below where it says Consumer Financial Protection
- 20 Bureau dispute completed, could you read that --
- 21 those three paragraphs, and then I'll ask you a
- 22 question about it?
- A. The office of the Consumer Ombudsman for
- OCWEN Loan Servicing, LLC would like to take this
- opportunity to respond to your recent concern

August 28, 2015

150

- 1 regarding the referenced loan.
- The Consumer Ombudsman was created to
- 3 provide OCWEN customers with a resource to assist
- with unresolved concerns and issues. OCWEN is
- obligated to report the loan accurately to the credit
- bureaus based on the contractual due date.
- Further, if payments are not received
- 8 within the 30 days of the month, then the account
- 9 would be reported as delinquent. The March -- the
- March 26, 2013 payment was received on April 30th,
- 2013, which was 30 to 59 days past due; therefore,
- 12 the credit reporting is valid.
- A further review indicates that on
- March 21st, 2014 our office submitted a request to
- the four major credit reporting agencies: Equifax,
- 16 TransUnion, Experian, and Innovis, to reflect the
- 17 current balance on the loan in the amount of
- 18 80,499.78. The confirmation number for this
- 19 electronically submitted update is 69189581. OCWEN
- 20 reports to Equifax, TransUnion, Experian, and
- 21 Innovis. These bureaus provide information to the
- local credit bureaus to update and current -- and
- collect the credit file. Unfortunately, OCWEN is
- 24 unable to control when the credit reporting agencies
- will update their records. In the interim you may